

MS

CONSEIL DE L'ATLANTIQUE NORD NORTH ATLANTIC COUNCIL

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH
15th June, 1970

NATO UNCLASSIFIED
SUMMARY RECORD
AG/214-R/3

COMMITTEE ON THE CHALLENGES OF MODERN SOCIETY

Summary record of a meeting held at the NATO
Headquarters, Brussels, on 13th and 14th April, 1970

PRESENT

Chairmen: Mr. Gunnar Randers

BELGIUM

Ambassador Leroy
Mr. Errera
Mr. Dubois
Prof. Capart
Cmtd. Reison
Mr. G. de Brouwere

CANADA

Ambassador R. Campbell
Dr. R.J. Uffen
Mr. C.J. Marshall
Dr. N. Campbell
Dr. R.W. Durie
Mr. G. Valiquette

DENMARK

Mr. Per Fergo
Mr. K. Due

FRANCE

Ambassador de Tricornot
de Rose
Mr. Essig
Mr. Cherret
Mr. des Longchamps
Mr. J.P. Barré

GERMANY

Ambassador W.G. Grewe
Prof. R. Dahrendorf
Dr. H. Haedrich
Dr. A. Katin
Mr. P. Pritz
Mr. R. Bonk
Mr. W. Goerke
Miss U. Mayer-Schalburg

GREECE

Ambassador Ph. Annino
Cavalierato
Mr. P. Kyriakoulakos

ICELAND

Mr. I. Ingvarsson

ITALY

The Right Hon. Carlo
Scarascia Mugnozza, MP
Mr. Guiseppe Iacoangeli
Mr. Ferretti

LUXEMBOURG

Mr. P. Hertz

NETHERLANDS

Ambassador R. Fack
Mr. W.J. Elzinga
Mr. C.J. Schneider

NORWAY

Ambassador G. Kristiansen
Mr. C. Prebensen

PORTUGAL

Prof. Alves Martins
Prof. Carvalho Guerra
Cmdr. Daniel Rodrigues
Ing. Sidónio Martins
Gada,
Mr. José Manuel dos
Santos Mota
Mr. M. Teixeira da Cunha

TURKEY

Ambassador M.N. Birgi
Mr. Faruk Sahinbas
Prof. Nimet Ozdas
Adm. N. Serdaroglu

UNITED KINGDOM

Ambassador
Sir Bernard Burrows
Dr. A.H. Cottrell
Mr. A.D.P. Pemberton-
Pigott
Mr. A.E. Davidson
Mr. R.P. Flower

UNITED STATES

Ambassador R. Ellsworth
Mr. Daniel P. Moynihan
Mr. H. Heffner
Mr. G.S. Vest
Mr. A. Berlind
Mr. H. Blaney
Dr. R. Brenner
Mr. G.B. Helmen
Mr. C. Herter, Jr.
Dr. K. Jones
Mr. H. Lindjord
Mr. J. Ludwig
The Hon. R. Lugar
Mr. A. Marcellin
Mr. J.T. Morris
Mr. J. Policastro

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

INTERNATIONAL STAFF

Deputy to the Acting Chairman:
Secretary:

Mr. Y. Leulan
Mr. L. Thiébault

ALSO PRESENT

Division of Scientific Affairs:

Dr. H. Arnth-Jensen
Mr. M.A.G. Knight
Dr. A.J. Shaler

Economic Directorate:

Mr. G. de Lacombe
Mr. A. Houel
Mr. R. Killingbeck
Mr. N. Wegter

Civil Emergency Planning Director:

Mr. M. Deveglio

Civil Emergency Planning Directorate:

Mr. A. Pauly

Press Service:

Mr. De Vries

CONTENTS

<u>Item</u>	<u>Subject</u>	<u>Paragraph Nos.</u>
I.	Introduction	1 - 21
II.	Methods of work	22 - 48
III.	Progress reports of pilot projects	49 - 145
IV.	Possible future projects	146 - 156
V.	Examination of environmental studies more appropriate to East-West co-operation	157 - 165
VI.	Progress report to Ministers	166 - 168
VII.	Date of next meeting	169
	Annexes I - IV	

I. INTRODUCTION

References: AC/274-R/1
AC/274-R/2
AC/274-D/2

1. The CHAIRMAN expressed his pleasure in welcoming national delegations to this second Plenary Session of the CCMS, which he opened with a review of the events which had succeeded the Committee's first meeting in December 1969. He said it could be seen that the CCMS had made an encouraging start, and that the promises of the first meeting were now beginning to come to fruition. However, a few points had emerged to which the Committee might wish to give its consideration.

2. The first of these was the problem of duplication with other international organizations already engaged or about to engage in the environment field, and in this connection, he reported on steps taken to establish co-operative relations with the Council of Europe and the OECD. As a result of such contacts, good personal relationships had been established. It had been the common attitude of the Secretaries-General that it was important to keep each other mutually informed by intermittent meetings and a regular exchange of documents, and it had been judged preferable not to attempt to define areas of responsibility or action, since these would be determined by a natural development related to the field of competence of the individual organization. It was also envisaged to get in touch with the European Communities, where apparently consideration was being given to taking an initiative in the environment field.

3. The CCMS might also wish at the present session to discuss the possibility of exchanging observers with other international organizations. The desirability of having experts and technicians from other organizations or third countries working with pilot countries might be considered. A preliminary exchange of views on the subject had already taken place at the Council meeting of 8th April, 1970; it had been decided to await any recommendation that might be presented by the CCMS on the basis of the technical benefits that might be drawn from the participation of outside observers or experts, and then to take up discussion of the political implications of such recommendations.

4. Having drawn attention to the change in Agenda Item V on East-West co-operation which indicated that the Committee should define which subjects might prove technically appropriate for co-operation and did not have to consider the political aspects of any such co-operation, he went on to suggest that another problem for the CCMS to tackle concerned the proceedings of pilot study groups under the sponsorship and responsibility of pilot countries.

5. It was clear from decisions which had been taken on procedural matters that it was entirely up to the pilot country to conduct such meetings as they might wish. However, it seemed from the Committee's albeit short experience that it might appear useful to add further guidelines which could be proposed by the CCMS to the pilot countries in view of future pilot group meetings. These would, of course, be intended to help experts in achieving effective work and should emphasise the basic target of such groups, namely, to carry out pilot studies in as little time as possible, and normally without large scale symposia or general scientific conferences, in order that concrete recommendations may be forwarded to the CCMS for approval.

6. He emphasised that the CCMS's basic goal was action and that once a recommendation of the Committee had been adopted by the Council and brought to the attention of the various member governments, a reporting procedure might have to be established whereby the Secretariat would be able to give an account to the Committee of resulting action taken by the governments or other agencies. This was not as yet a pressing point, but he would hope attention could be given to its early solution.

7. He also felt compelled to draw the attention of the Committee to the difficulties encountered by the International Secretariat in coping with the new tasks entrusted to it for the service of the CCMS, since no funds had yet been provided for that purpose. He expected this could be remedied and that national delegates to the Budget Committee would consider favourably requests for funds which might be put forward there for CCMS purposes.

8. Mr. MOYNIHAN (United States) recalled that President Nixon's hypothesis relating modern man to his environment had comprised three basic propositions:

- that there existed within the nations of the North Atlantic Alliance a powerful, if still somewhat latent, concern with the deterioration, indeed, in many instances, the degradation, of the national environment under the impact of technologically based industrialisation. Correspondingly, that there existed an equally widespread conviction that the opportunities provided by that same technology to create a significantly more fulfilling and meaningful social environment had only begun to be realised;

- that there was already in existence a considerable body of technical knowledge that, if applied with sufficient vigour and purpose, would enable industrial societies to halt and to reverse the degradation of the natural environment, and also that the methodologies of contemporary social enquiry offered considerable possibilities for social advances;
- that NATO countries, in the course of two decades of military alliance and political consultation, had acquired the governmental skills which would enable them to act in concert with respect to those aspects of the natural and social environment which either required international action or which might best respond to a multinational effort.

9. He said it was not his purpose to review what had happened since the CCMS had been established to pursue these propositions, but simply to restate the very strong view of the Government of the United States, that, if anything, President Nixon had underestimated the mounting concern with these subjects in all member nations, and the rapidly coalescing political and social will to do something to meet the challenge.

10. In the four months since the CCMS' first meeting, the United States had pursued intensely the three topics for which it had offered itself as pilot country. These were difficult subjects: elusive in the face of analysis, obdurate in the face of effort. There were but limited grounds for optimism about any of them. Yet the most extraordinary progress could be reported, for advances had been made in four months which would have taken as many years in the ordinary course of international affairs. Governments were clearly setting a very different pace although it was already evident that they were still in many cases dangerously behind their peoples in these matters.

11. Confirming that the reports on the specific projects would be given later in the meeting, Mr. Moynihan concluded with an expression of his Government's determined wish that not only should the CCMS' present Agenda be completed, but that it might also be expanded, with respect to its activities and the participants engaged therein. Finally, he reaffirmed the firm expectation of his Authorities that action should remain the purpose of the Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society.

12. Dr. UFFEN (Canada) spoke of the growing interest and importance being attached by the Canadian Government and people to the problems of the human environment, to a point where such questions had been acknowledged as a priority activity. This sentiment had, he said, led to an increasing appreciation of the international aspects of the problem, and of the value of the contribution which NATO could make in the area. The member countries of NATO constituted an immense reservoir of ideas and expertise and, by virtue of the working habits it had developed over the years, the Alliance could make a substantial contribution by its capacity to provide a basis for common action.

13. At the same time, the multiplicity of activity on such questions on an international level must be recognised, and although it was a good thing, in that the problems were of vital universal concern and could only benefit by close international co-operation, the situation did give rise to increasing problems on a national level in co-ordinating the approach of the numerous departments and agencies involved.

14. The Canadian Government, aware of the need for real co-ordination if its energy and resources were effectively to be deployed, had established a major inter-departmental committee with responsibility for co-ordinating all aspects of Canada's international activities in the environmental field. Under this Committee, which would provide overall guidance and co-ordination of the day to day activities of the individual international agencies, it was proposed to establish a series of sub-committees or working groups, the first of which had already been established to deal with the CCMS. As Chairman, Dr. Uffen had the responsibility to report periodically to the Privy Council Committee on Scientific and Industrial Research, and to seek policy direction as required. He expected this new administrative mechanism would facilitate Canadian attempts to make the best possible use of available resources, although it would not, of course, solve all problems. He looked forward to discussing with his colleagues the plans of other member governments with respect to co-ordination.

15. Paying tribute to the high level of all-round co-operation between CCMS members and the excellent work of the Chairman and his staff, Dr. Uffen went on to observe that the Committee had begun to function effectively with a minimum of delay and had remarkably few organizational problems. In connection with the question of the publicity of CCMS activity, he said he believed the most forthcoming approach possible should be adopted. As to the Agenda, he noted the timeliness and importance of several topics for discussion and said his Delegation looked forward to participating in the deliberations, even though the major Canadian contribution would be related specifically to the project on inland water pollution which Canada intended to pilot. Considerable Canadian interest was also involved in the Belgian proposal for the study of coastal water pollution which they were willing to co-pilot and in the German and French pilot projects.

16. With the immediate task of launching the CCMS now behind, the Committee's main concern would be to ensure that the interest and enthusiasm generated would be justified by concrete results in individual projects undertaken. Recognising that this was indeed the hardest part of the task, Dr. Uffen concluded by expressing his confidence that, with the momentum already established, a great deal could be accomplished.

17. Mr. SAHINBAS (Turkey) said his Government had warmly welcomed the idea of examining within NATO the problems of modern societies concerning the physical and social environment, and believed that the success of the CCMS would help NATO to acquire a new dimension beyond political consultation and military co-operation. The vital importance and complex nature of environmental problems, as well as the pressing need for their solution, were underlined by the fact that they were not limited by geographic or political frontiers. And the divergencies in the economic development of various NATO countries and non-NATO countries should not prevent modern society from facing problems which were common to all of them. The Turkish Government considered the new initiative and activity of the Alliance as not only an effort directed to preserving and improving human life and solving the problems of modern society, but also one which might eventually contribute to the détente.

18. It was with such considerations in mind that Turkey had taken an active part in the activities which led to the establishment of the Committee, and had become a co-pilot to one of the subjects selected for urgent study, namely, air pollution. Similarly, Turkey had sent representatives to the general exploratory meeting to organize the disaster assistance project and to the technical meeting on the road safety project, and had taken administrative steps to set up a high-level governmental body for co-ordination between several governmental organizations on environmental problems.

19. Although Turkey had offered to be a co-pilot to only one of the projects adopted by the CCMS and the Council, other subjects closely interested them; a brief study of statistical data for Turkey regarding road safety and disaster relief indicated the vital importance of finding urgent solutions to these problems, and, in this connection, he brought to the Committee's notice certain figures which gave an impressive idea of the magnitude of the problems and the urgency of their consideration. Open water pollution was also rapidly becoming a national concern for this country, which was, of course, surrounded by the sea on three sides.

20. Turning specifically to the earthquake disaster which had taken place on 28th March, 1970 in Central West Anatolia, the speaker said that Gediz, Akcaalan, Emet and Simav, as well as 28 villages in the area, had been severely hit. According to the latest official information available, 1,089 people had been killed, 1,157 injured, approximately 20,000 buildings completely destroyed, approximately 10,000 buildings heavily damaged, and about 100,000 persons left homeless as a result of this latest disaster. The Turkish Red Crescent Society and Turkish Governmental bodies had taken immediate action for relief to the disaster stricken people, supported by a nation-wide relief campaign. On behalf

of his Authorities, he wished to express the gratitude of the Turkish Government to international organisations and individual countries, not least the NATO Allies, who had offered prompt material and financial assistance to alleviate the sufferings of the survivors.

21. The COMMITTEE:

took note of the opening statements made by the various speakers.

II. METHODS OF WORK

Relations with Press and Public

22. Invited by the Chairman to comment on whether and how the proceedings of the CCMS should be publicised, Mr. MARSHALL (Canada) stated that as far as pilot projects were concerned, he believed that meetings should be open to participation by any interested person, at least as far as this was practical. Reports on the proceedings of such meetings and their outcome should similarly be made widely available.

23. Canada was in favour of the Council's ruling, that the CCMS deliberations should be exclusive. However, in order to give maximum information to the public, the Chairman should make an oral statement to the Press at the close of the proceedings, the general lines of which would have been approved by the Committee in session.

24. Reports by the Chairman to the Council should be unclassified documents but, in his view, should be made available to delegations for their comments in the first instance, since they would contain explicit national views. Only after such comments had been obtained should one consider whether they might be suitable for release to the Press or other international parties.

25. Mr. HEFFNER (United States) was also of the opinion that the deliberations of experts in pilot project groups should be given wide publicity although he recognised that the documents directly generated by the proceedings of such groups were not necessarily the best way in which this could be done.

26. His attitude to the publication of plenary deliberations was flexible and based on the thought that greater respect would accrue from an increased public knowledge of the Committee's activities. On the other hand there were areas of sensitivity which would not necessarily be advanced by their being made known publicly. In conclusion he believed it was preferable to be guided by experience in this matter and not to bind oneself at this stage with any rigid ruling. He suggested that an effort be made to develop an effective public information programme, retaining actual Committee documentation as background information for the Press. He also proposed that the greatest latitude be given to the Chairman as regards press releases after meetings.

27. Mr. ESSIG (France) confirmed his view that responsibility for agreeing to a restricted or to a wider distribution of documents prepared by individual nations within the framework of pilot projects, remained with their authors. Once they had been published as NATO unclassified documents, the views of the latter should also be sought before they could be generally distributed.

28. Dr. COTTRELL (United Kingdom) agreed that as a basic policy the work of the CCMS should be seen to be open and unclassified and that observers should be admitted as far as possible. With respect to press statements, he believed it was necessary to keep "housekeeping" matters aside but that otherwise publicity was an excellent thing.

29. The CHAIRMAN pointed out that there was a distinction between distribution and availability; one might consider distributing a press release, whilst the Chairman's reports might only be made available on a case-by-case basis upon individual requests.

30. Mr. PREBENSEN (Norway) believed that a report to the Council, albeit unclassified, remained a report for the Council's exclusive consideration. As regards CCMS, he felt that either the Council itself would have to agree that any such Chairman's report might be made publicly available, or else a clear distinction be drawn between a Chairman's report on the one hand and any type of statement to the Press on the other.

31. In reply to the Canadian and Norwegian observations, the CHAIRMAN pointed out that his report to the Council was in fact his own personal comment on the Committee's activities and was noted by the Council as such. On the other hand, he had understood that there was a fairly general desire that whatever was shown to the Press would have to have the prior approval of national delegations, and there was of course no difficulty or objection to that.

32. Mr. FERGO (Denmark) and Mr. PEMBERTON-PIGOTT (United Kingdom) expressed the importance they attached to their being an announcement to the Press immediately after the closure of the CCMS meeting, and Ambassador FACK (Netherlands) added that the importance attached to the public distribution of the Chairman's report was probably overestimated, since the time which elapsed before its completion, detracted from its news value.

33. Mr. MARSHALL, having reiterated his concern that the Chairman's report should not be distributed beyond the confines of NATO, the CHAIRMAN emphasised that there was a considerable difference between the procedures for issuing statements for the Press and, for example, the availability of documents on request to members of the Council of Europe or OECD.

34. Noting the statements which had been made in discussion, he concluded that there was consensus in favour of giving a wide publicity to the progress of the activities of pilot projects, their pilot studies. This would be done directly by pilot countries or in agreement with them and co-pilot countries when there were any. With respect to plenary sessions, he had noted some lack of enthusiasm for the distribution outside NATO of the Chairman's reports to the Council and a feeling in favour of the Chairman making statements to the Press after the meetings. This he would do, after having noted which subjects of the discussion the Committee preferred to underline or to handle with discretion.

Observers: Pilot Projects

35. The CHAIRMAN said the problem of the admission of observers was a rather new one since it had not generally been the practice so far to admit any observers to NATO meetings. However, in view of the special character of the CCMS, it appeared from a previous discussion in the Council, that a number of countries would probably be in favour of not imposing too many limitations as far as technical meetings of pilot projects were concerned. Nevertheless, a final decision of the matter would be dependent upon the recommendations which the Council received from the CCMS itself.

36. Mr. HEFFNER was strongly in favour of allowing pilot countries to invite outside participants to meetings connected with their specific projects; furthermore, he preferred to leave to the discretion of the pilot country to decide whether or not a distinction should be drawn between such participants, whether acting in a personal capacity or as representatives of industry or of any other organization.

37. Mr. MARSHALL associated himself entirely with this position; in his view it was inconceivable that project activities be restricted in any way.

38. Ambassador LEROY (Belgium) agreed that the admittance of outside participants to project meetings would be of considerable value in many respects, but he wondered whether it lay within the pilot countries' competence to take the kind of political decision which might be thus involved.

39. Ambassador FACK pointed out that the political implications of not admitting observers might in certain cases be vital.

40. Mr. DROGE (Germany) felt some distinction should be drawn between observers who might attend in their own right as individual experts and those representing industry or organizations.

41. The CHAIRMAN suggested that the problem of dividing the status of respective participants would probably solve itself once a decision of basic policy was taken.

42. The COMMITTEE:

agreed to recommend to the Council that pilot countries in agreement with their co-pilots should be responsible for inviting the participation of outside experts to their pilot study group meetings when appropriate.

Observers: Plenary Session

43. The CHAIRMAN informed the Committee that a request had been received from the North Atlantic Assembly for an observer of that organization to attend plenary meetings of the CCMS. The Committee, whose recommendation was awaited by the Council before a decision on this matter would be reached, might therefore consider not only the principle of such an admission, but also more specifically whether an invitation be extended to a parliamentarian or to a member of the North Atlantic Assembly Secretariat. Concerning other organizations, whose membership involved non-NATO nations, he said that the principle of reciprocity and mutual benefit might be considered as a proper basis for admitting observers or not to CCMS meetings.

44. Mr. PEMBERTON-PIGOTT and Mr. FERGO confirmed the liberal attitude of the United Kingdom and Denmark to the attendance of observers from outside organisations.

45. Mr. SAHINBAS whose statement was supported by representatives from France, Italy and Germany, was also aware of the advantages of such a practice, but preferred that this be a matter for case-by-case decision.

46. Mr. BARRE (France) noted that the Council's decision on the free availability of CCMS documents to those who might request them would certainly exclude to a large extent the need for observer participation in Committee activities.

47. Mr. MOYNIHAN said he very much hoped that a member of the North Atlantic Assembly of the Assembly's own choice would attend the forthcoming CCMS meetings.

48. The COMMITTEE:

- (1) agreed to inform the Council that it was favouring in principle a liberal approach to the question of observers;
- (2) recommended that the Council should decide upon admittance of observers to the plenary meetings on a case-by-case basis;
- (3) recommended that an observer from the North Atlantic Assembly should be permitted to attend at forthcoming CCMS meetings.

III. PROGRESS REPORTS ON PILOT PROJECTS

(a) Air Pollution

Document: AC/274-D/4

49. Introducing Mr. Ludwig and Dr. Jones of the US National Air Pollution Control Administration, Dr. HEPPNER (United States) emphasised that the activities of the air pollution project which had the US as pilot and Turkey as co-pilot, were primarily aimed at achieving rapid action; it was hoped that the three preparatory studies, which were to be described in the presentation, would lead in approximately twelve months' time to the formulation of recommendations for submission to the CCMS.

50. Dr. LUDWIG discussed some of the broader implications of the pilot study which was, he said, designed to employ existing scientific knowledge for the development of rational long-range air pollution control programmes for general use throughout the world. The CCMS activity was unique in international co-operative activities in the air pollution area in that it addressed precisely this critical "utilisation of knowledge" phase; the project would not specifically determine research needs or aim at stimulating bilateral or multi-lateral co-operative endeavours to satisfy such needs, but, rather, put together for general use compendiums of critical areas of knowledge needed to formulate and carry out control programmes within the institutional framework of any country in the world.

51. It was intended, first, within a year to develop criteria documents for sulphur oxides and particulate pollutants relating the dosages of the latter to all types of effects - human health, economic or aesthetic. Such criteria were critically related to standards, of course, and agreements on these would entail a secondary commitment that certain items would be considered in the standard-setting process, should any country decide to follow up the CCMS project and actually form a control programme.

52. Second, it was intended to use mathematical modelling in the formulation of long-range control programmes, and in assessing their progress. The particular CCMS aspect of this study could be distinguished from the modelling programmes of other organizations by the following summary:

- the improvement of models by a consideration of their mathematical formulations and their relation to the real atmosphere on various time and distance scales (WMO);
- the delineation of the models' usefulness as administrative tools and the activities essential for their use (OECD);
- the use of models as far as possible in active programmes (CCMS).

53. Thirdly, it was intended to undertake co-operatively and within the CCMS group an assessment of air pollution in the Ankara and Frankfurt areas, using modelling techniques, which could then be further combined as desired by Turkish and German officials with their employment of the criteria and control techniques documents, for the formulation of control programmes in these two areas.

54. United States documents on air pollution criteria and control technology had been distributed as illustrative of the documents to be produced by the CCMS project. The pilot group's task would be to produce new documents reflecting the inputs of not only the pilot and co-pilot countries but of any other country desirous of participating, either by direct representation or through written comments. It was hoped to make these NATO documents as comprehensive as possible so as to improve their use by any country, world-wide.

55. Dr. JONES elaborated on specific aspects of the work of the project to date, detailing in particular the meetings which had taken place between the pilot and co-pilot countries in Ankara and the discussions which had followed in Bonn. The document at reference and the progress report which had been circulated formed the basis of his statement.

56. Mr. SAHINBAS commented on the keen interest with which the Turkish public had followed the meeting in Ankara of the CCMS Working Group, and of the extensive coverage which was given to the event by the Turkish press and radio. He believed an important aim of the Committee's work had thus been achieved and that this would facilitate the realisation of that important objective; high-level action.

57. Mr. GOERKE (Germany) said his Authorities welcomed the United States initiative in outlining procedures in the air pollution field. The Federal Republic was endeavouring to complete financial arrangements for the pursuit of its activities under this project and was hopeful of being able to proceed at full speed at the end of 1970. Preliminary steps had been taken in the Frankfurt area where first results were already available. Several important working panels had been constituted to analyse the United States control criteria and techniques.

58. The Right Hon. Scarasola MUGNOZZA (Italy) stated that he was as yet unable to give details of the Italian contribution to the air pollution project but undertook to inform the Committee as rapidly as possible of the names of experts likely to participate.

59. Ambassador FACK gave assurances of the Netherlands continuing interest in this subject especially with respect to the expert Sub-Committee on Modelling.

60. Mr. FERGO reported that Denmark hoped to participate in the project in future, although organizational problems had prevented an expert from attending the Ankara meeting.

61. Concluding discussion on this item, the CHAIRMAN remarked on two administrative problems which had arisen: firstly, the difficulties involved for smaller nations of ensuring participation in pilot studies because of the limited expertise they had available, and, indeed, the overall question of the organization of attendance of experts, and second, the value of publicity. In connection with the latter he referred to the consensus view which had emerged in discussion that it was of considerable advantage to the CCMS task that its pilot projects be publicly known and publicly praised. He suggested, and it was agreed, that the progress report on the air pollution project contained in the document at reference could be distributed to those who might wish to see it.

62. The COMMITTEE:

noted with appreciation the reports made by the United States and Turkey on the air pollution project and the comments made in discussion.

(b) Pollution of coastal waters

References: Belgian note LT(70)06 dated
2nd February, 1970

Note ASG.SA(70)105 dated 24th March, 1970

63. Ambassador LEROY (Belgium) explained the general lines along which his country proposed to study coastal pollution, and the strictly national steps taken to list remedial measures already available and draw up a programme of work as a basis for co-operation with the co-pilot countries.

64. Dr. COTTRELL paid tribute to the eminent Belgian specialist, Professor Capart, and said that the United Kingdom had undertaken, within the framework of the IMCO, certain studies on sea pollution. He stressed that studies on sea pollution by waste oil must be closely co-ordinated with those of the Belgian Authorities.

65. Commander RENSON (Belgium) explained that a number of national and international bodies, in addition to IMCO, were already concerned with various aspects of the problem. However, the special purpose of the Organizing Committee which was to be set up would be to detect and evaluate the threat and to determine rapidly what defensive measures, including chemical, physical or biological neutralisation, should be employed to counteract it. With regard to national plans, co-ordination with other institutions would be particularly useful for ensuring compatibility between the various defensive measures.

66. Mr. MOYNIHAN referred to the technological aspect of such measures and mentioned the problem of legal responsibility for oil pollution due to shipping accidents.

67. Commander RENSON pointed out that, so far, the work to be sponsored by the Organizing Committee did not cover the legal side of the matter. A list of studies already carried out in this field, especially by IMCO, would however be drawn up.

68. Mr. CAMPBELL (Canada) described the recent experience of the Canadian Authorities in combating oil pollution arising from the breaking up of a tanker in a cold maritime region where there was intensive fishing activity. He referred to the economic and social facets of the problem (psychological shock to the coastal population as a result of widespread damage) and gave some details of the methods used to contain the oil slick and to recover the many tons which had sunk with the stern section of the ship. He added that, as a result of this experience, scientific studies would be carried out which would cover in particular the oceanographical aspect of the problem.

69. Professor CAPART (Belgium) made a statement on studies already undertaken and on measures adopted in connection with the activities of the NATO Science Committee and Oceanographic Sub-Committee. In order to promote an exchange of information on sea pollution, it had been decided to set up, in Brussels, an information centre, in the form of an inter-university group of experts. Various international meetings would also be held this year and at the end of the year it was intended to take stock of studies carried out so far.

70. He then mentioned certain aspects of the bacteriological pollution of the European coastline and stressed the valuable part played by Portugal, the co-pilot country for this project.

71. Mr. MARTINS (Portugal) gave details of the way in which the various tasks had been shared between Belgium and Portugal, the latter country being mainly concerned with experimental work off its own coast.

72. Mr. MOYNIHAN congratulated the Belgian Delegation on the study undertaken. He said that the United States would be happy to participate in the first meeting of the Organizing Committee, which was to be held in Brussels in May 1970.

73. Mr. CAMPBELL spoke of the technical aspect of detecting oil pollution and referred to Canada's experience in this field.

74. Commander RENSON said it was planned to list all types of detection facilities, visual and electronic, and that Canada's collaboration in the work of the conference would be welcomed.

75. Mr. SAHINBAS then made a short informatory statement on the organization by Bulgaria of a conference on pollution in the Black Sea, which was to take place in September 1970 and which his country had been invited to attend. He would inform the Committee later of any conclusions which were likely to be of interest in its work.

76. The CHAIRMAN said that a similar problem existed in the Baltic. In the next few months important work would be done in connection with detection of and defence against pollution of coastal waters. He hoped that all nations who were, for various reasons, concerned by this question would take part; progress would undoubtedly be made.

(c) Inland Water Pollution

77. Dr. DURIE (Canada), Head of the Water Policy Advisory Section in the Policy and Planning Branch of the Canadian Department of Energy, Mines and Resources, gave a presentation on the problem of the pollution of inland waters, which he concluded with an invitation to the countries of the NATO Alliance to participate in a proposed pilot project under the CCMS to develop comprehensive basin plans for inland water pollution control with public participation in the planning process(1).

78. Mr. HERTER (United States) commented on the responsibility of the United States in the inland waterway pollution situation, in particular, in relation to Canada, with whom the United States shared of course many miles of inland waterway frontiers. It was on this basis, he said, that the United States offered its services as co-pilot in the project set forth by his Canadian colleague.

79. Mr. CHERRET (France) affirmed his country's interest in the problem of inland waterway pollution. This was, he said, an area in which Europe had long been interested; he called attention in particular, on the Rhine Water Management Committee which had existed for some ten years. As regards the Canadian project, his country would be willing to participate in the proposed exchange of views between experts which he understood might be held in Washington just before or after a meeting of an OECD Group scheduled for 30th July. His country would also be willing to co-pilot the Canadian study on inland water pollution.

80. The CHAIRMAN raised a question with respect to the duplication of activity between work under the aegis of the CCMS and the area of responsibility of the OECD Water Management Organization, to which the Canadian Representative agreed to reply at a future date.

81. The COMMITTEE:

- (1) noted with appreciation the Canadian presentation of its pilot project on inland waterways pollution, of the United States and French intention to co-pilot this project and of other statements made during discussion;
- (2) noted that a preliminary meeting of experts would be held in Brussels, probably towards the latter part of June or in Washington late in July.

(1) The text of this statement was circulated to participants at the meeting and a copy is attached at Annex I to the present record.

(d) Disaster Assistance Programme

Document: AC/274-D/3

82. Having expressed the regret at the absence of General Lincoln, Director of the Office of Emergency Preparedness, Mr. Lindjord (United States) introduced document AC/274-D/3, which described the progress so far achieved on the Disaster Assistance Project. Summary statements of disaster experience and arrangements in individual member countries were being prepared by Italy, Canada and the Netherlands for circulation shortly as Annexes thereto.

83. With an expression of sincere sympathy to Mr. Sahinbas and the Turkish Delegation, the speaker went on to comment on the recent disastrous earthquake in Western Turkey, suggesting in this connection that a brief statement on the problems encountered in coping with the effects of the catastrophe might provide realistic background for a consideration of the proposals made in the report put forward by the United States together with Turkey. He intended to discuss in his statement how it was hoped that by updating and refining existing procedures, the capability available to the Secretary General for responding to such disaster situations could be improved.

84. In addressing this problem, discussions had been guided by the following considerations:

- when a major natural disaster occurs, early and rapid action is needed. The primary concern is to save lives, reduce human suffering and prevent further destruction or damage;
- past experience has shown that assistance to stricken countries has usually been furnished on a unilateral basis and has consequently been at times inappropriate and only partially effective;
- international disaster relief has been provided by such international organizations as the United Nations and the League of Red Cross Societies. Attention was consequently paid to ensuring that action under NATO aegis would not duplicate but, rather, complement the capabilities of such organizations.

85. It was felt that NATO organizational capabilities, such as the Situation Centre and the NATO-Wide Communications System were suited for providing an improved mechanism for concerting disaster assistance within NATO. Such mechanism should be designed so that it did not become a bottleneck.

86. He laid special emphasis on the two symposia that had been planned at the Rome meeting, one to be held in October in Italy on Flood Mitigation, the other to be held in the United States in the Spring of 1971 on Earthquake Hazard Reduction. Specific reference had also been made to the updating of document C-M(58)102, which defined the rôle of NATO in case of disaster. He mentioned that weather modification might also be studied at a later stage, once the first three main items he had just mentioned had been dealt with satisfactorily.

87. Mr. SAHINBAS, in reply to the United States and in amplification of his introductory statement under Item I, recalled that only a few days before the Gediz disaster, Turkish Representatives from the Red Crescent Society and the Earthquake Research Institute had participated actively in the general exploratory meeting in Rome; subsequent events had served but to underline the common awareness expressed during that meeting of the need for ensuring the assistance required by such large-scale unexpected happenings, and in particular, the importance of early, rapid and co-ordinated aid to the survivors.

88. One problem which had arisen at the Gediz disaster was the result of severe damage to access routes and communications in the area; the number of helicopters available to the Turkish Air Force for conveying material assistance to remote villages was clearly inadequate. As far as material needs themselves were concerned, it had been possible to establish a list in order of priority as follows:

- Tents
- Blankets
- Ambulances
- Water tanks
- Foodstuffs of durable nature
- Clothing

A large number of such materials had been provided by government organizations and individual nations throughout the world and the Turkish Government could only reiterate its profound gratitude to those who were so prompt to meet these short-term needs. To such a list might also be added the longer-term requirement for iron bars and construction materials.

89. Mr. KYRIAKOULAKOS (Greece) as representative of a country with long experience of natural disasters, said he felt Greece could provide useful information to the exploration of these projects and undertook to send a representative to forthcoming meetings.

90. Mr. FERGO gave his approval to the conclusions and recommendations contained in the disaster assistance project report. He said his country had been represented at the exploratory meeting on disaster assistance by the present Chairman of the Civil Defence Committee. It was, he said, gratifying to note that these two bodies were co-ordinating their respective activities.

91. Mr. ESSIG stressed the universal character of problems arising from the organization of operations for the relief of large-scale natural disasters. For many years past, certain international bodies had devoted their efforts to these activities, which must in no way be interfered with by the proposed CCMS studies. Generally speaking however, consultation between Alliance members with a view to mutual assistance in case of need was obviously desirable. He wondered whether it was really necessary to seek a more precise rôle for the Alliance in this connection.

92. Mr. DROGE emphasised that Germany had taken a large part in relief action in Gediz and that the absence of a German expert at the meeting on this subject in no way indicated a lack of interest on the part of the Federal Republic who endorsed the conclusions and recommendations of the pilot and co-pilot nations.

93. There was one aspect of the problem of which no mention had as yet been made, namely, the legal implications of disaster relief. It seemed, indeed, that rapid and early action could be accelerated and facilitated by a number of arrangements such as the easing of frontier regulations, the waiving of customs formalities as well as the clarification of a number of problems concerning control authority, logistic support for personnel assisting in relief operations and damages.

94. Ambassador FACK referred to the first of the major conclusions of the exploratory meeting on disaster assistance, which stated that NATO Governments "should concert their actions in providing disaster relief and rehabilitation assistance to a stricken member nation in a massive disaster" Reminding the Committee of catastrophes which had already taken place in areas not far from the NATO geographical area, he asked whether the pilot nations anticipated attention being given to the possibility of concerted action for the benefit of non-member nations. Whilst not directly advocating such arrangements, he believed there were political considerations which made it preferable to give some thought to the question.

95. Mr. LINDJORD remarked that the section of the report referred to by his Dutch colleague clearly stated that NATO activity in the field of disaster assistance did not in any way infringe upon whatever action national governments would deem it necessary to make individually or bilaterally inside or outside the framework of the Alliance. This he pointed out was basically a political issue and was clearly somewhat beyond the immediate scope of the project. On the other hand, further work on the procedures and general organization of disaster relief was envisaged and consideration would probably be given to an extension of the use of the planning foreseen in the report to non-NATO nations.

96. Mr. PREBENSEN urged that due consideration be given to the question of using the proposed standby capability or mechanism for a clearing house or co-ordinating rôle especially for non-NATO nations, before a recommendation to this effect be put to the Council. Whilst Mr. HELMAN (United States), expending on his French colleague's thought that non-NATO nations might not in fact wish to receive "NATO assistance", commented that a conclusion to this question might be related to the Committee's decision on the admission of observers.

97. Mr. MARSHALL asked what would be the relationship of the NATO/CCMS activity to the well established co-ordinating functions of the International Red Cross, to which Mr. LINDJORD replied that a preliminary investigation into the work of the League of Red Cross Societies, had proved conclusively that NATO disaster relief work could and should only supplement Red Cross activities and that it would be indeed detrimental to disaster assistance to work in any other way.

98. The COMMITTEE:

- (1) noted with appreciation the presentation by the United States on the pilot study on disaster relief programme and of the statements made in discussion;
- (2) noted that a Symposium on Flood Mitigation was planned for October 1970 with an organisational meeting scheduled for June 1970;
- (3) noted that a Symposium on Earthquake Hazard Reduction was planned for March or early April 1971 with an organizational meeting scheduled for May or early June 1970;
- (4) agreed to invite the Council to endorse the major conclusions set out in paragraph 20 of AC/274-D/3 dealing with NATO's rôle in disaster assistance, and to:

- (a) reaffirm the responsibility of the Secretary General for disaster assistance efforts, as originally set out in C-M(58)102;
- (b) request the Secretary General to:
 - (i) establish a standby capability or mechanism for a clearing house or co-ordinating rôle as may be appropriate, avoiding unnecessary institutionalisation of procedures;
 - (ii) prepare in consultation with interested Permanent Representatives to NATO and the Civil Defence Committee a revised C-M document on NATO co-operation for disaster assistance;
 - (iii) develop, for internal use of the International Staff, a NATO manual for emergency operations which would include broad procedural guidance for nations requesting or offering disaster assistance;
 - (iv) assign continuing responsibility to an appropriate International Staff element for implementation of the conclusions concerning collection and dissemination of information to nations.

(e) Road Safety

Document: AC/274-D/5

99. Mr. MOYNIHAN in his introductory statement to the Road Safety Project, reminded the Committee that problems of preserving human life from the ever-increasing threat of death and destruction in automobile crashes was an ecological problem of major proportions and one which called for immediate action. Action had in fact been the objective of the technical meeting in March where eleven nations had been represented at the highest level of technical competence and industrial commitment; indeed, four specific events derived from the deliberations on that occasion.

100. The United States Project for an experimental safety vehicle had received enthusiastic support. The United States intended in June to offer contracts for the construction of a 4,000 pound experimental vehicle. They were moreover willing to hand over all research material and files to a consortium with the objective of building a 2,000 pound safety vehicle and with this in mind had approached several nations with automobile industries. The latter had shown great interest over the prospects of such a project but awaited confirmation from their Governments authorising an affirmative response.

101. A first international conference on automotive passive restraints was to be held in May 1970, amongst such devices the so-called "air bag" had attracted considerable attention. In this connection, Mr. Moynihan spoke of the potential effects on the international automobile trade of a unilateral United States decision to make such design features obligatory in new vehicles and urged that member nations encourage their car manufacturers to avail themselves of the United States readiness to make its technical know-how available on a co-operative basis. The May conference was to be sponsored by the United States as pilot Government, but would be hosted and organized by the four major United States automobile companies to whom the technological development of passive restraint techniques belonged.

102. The third important point which had emerged from the first technical meeting was the organization of emergency medical response systems; the United States had found itself to be considerably behind other nations such as Italy in this programme and was keen to obtain information in order to improve its national practices.

103. Finally, it was planned to hold a workshop on accident investigation, an area which could only benefit from a full and co-ordinated exchange of information and one in which immediate advantages could be obtained.

104. Dr. BRENNER (United States), Deputy Director of the US National Highway Safety Bureau, circulated copies of his report on the first technical meeting which he summarised orally, emphasising in particular the four points made by Mr. Moynihan. He said the problem of saving lives, and quickly, could only be brought under control by a systematic approach using proven methods of modern science and technology in order to reduce the frequency and severity of vehicle crashes both before during and after they had occurred. In order to accomplish this the technical meeting had selected eight areas worthy of priority attention:

operational and research investigation of crashes;

emergency medical response systems;

alcohol and driving;

seat belt usage;

passive restraints;

experimental safety vehicle;

identification and treatment of road hazards;

road safety manpower needs.

105. It was not intended that any of these subjects should become part of an effort continuing indefinitely into the future but rather that they terminate either as unilateral, bilateral or multilateral arrangements, or as separate reports for submission to the CCMS as part of the overall pilot study report now projected for December 1972.

106. Emphasising that the pilot study would be strongly oriented towards action at governmental level, Dr. Brenner observed that the United States intended to continue to support road safety research, but that whilst research was still urgently needed in the area, such was already known that could be placed into operating practice immediately. The technical meeting had unanimously concluded that high level government attention to this was long overdue.

107. Finally, attention was drawn to the proposed plan for future action contained in Section VI to AC/274-D/5 and in particular the invitation to interested member nations expressed in sub-paragraphs D and E.

108. Dr. COTTRELL expressed his appreciation of the manner in which the United States were treating this important study and their generosity in offering to disseminate technical information. He said United Kingdom experts had found the March meeting particularly stimulating and were at present exploring ways in which to collaborate effectively with the pilot country. There was quite considerable interest in the project for an experimental safety vehicle.

109. Mr. SCARASCIA MUGNOZZA said Italian interest in the experimental safety vehicle programme was also high. With respect to emergency medical response systems, his Government was ready to make available all possible information on the Italian co-ordinated system and extended an invitation to United States specialists to visit Italy in order to examine the organization at first hand and study the results of surveys made in this area by a number of Italian firms.

110. Mr. BONK (Germany) informed the Committee that in addition to their participation in the technical meeting in March, German road safety experts had also engaged in bilateral talks with representatives from the United States Ministry of Transportation as a result of which the Federal Republic had decided to draw up a report on national activities in the road safety field. He had moreover recommended to his Minister of Transport that further studies be initiated in operational and research investigations of vehicle crashes, road hazards, and the experimental safety vehicle, and in connection with the latter, he was authorised to express his Authorities interest in the development of a 2,000 pound vehicle.

111. Dr. UFFEN and Mr. SAHINBAS underlined the interest of the Canadian and Turkish Authorities in the proposed road safety programme and their Authorities intention to participate in a number of projects other than the experimental safety vehicle programme.

112. Mr. MARSHALL believed it was hardly likely that the road safety project would escape enormous public interest even outside the Alliance, and this being so its organization and treatment might be considered as a good basis for discussion of the long-term organization of CCMS projects.

113. Dr. BRENNER replied that the protection of human life from death on the roads was certainly a subject which transcended national boundaries; the United States had already discussed all aspects of road safety with other non-NATO nations and, in accordance with its responsibility to NATO, would continue to draw on world-wide experience in this field.

114. Mr. MOYNIHAN believed this was again a point closely related to the decision to be taken on observer participation in pilot projects. He did not believe there was any question of exclusivity in NATO/CCMS activity, rather, it was clear that member nations had now discovered in NATO a forum in which these things could be accomplished.

115. The COMMITTEE:

noted with appreciation the United States presentation on the road safety project and the statements of interest made in discussion.

116. Mr. BSSIG recalled the proposal made by France to the North Atlantic Council last January and drew the Committee's attention to the French offer to be responsible for a project in connection with the work of the CCMS. The subject of the proposed study would be "Environment in the strategy of regional development". This would be the eighth theme to be studied by the Committee.

117. France naturally hoped that other countries would co-operate and would add their own conclusions on a subject of such wide and general interest. It considered that the report should not be submitted until the end of 1971, so that the results of "sector" studies now in hand could be incorporated; it proposed to work along the following lines:

- following contact with other countries during the meeting, and in addition to exchanges of views with those which decided to collaborate with France in this pilot study, a three-day meeting would be arranged in February 1971 to discuss the theme, take stock of the work begun and decide how to complete it;

- the main effort would be directed towards research into "models" capable of taking into account the complex phenomena which modify the environment. Although there was no doubt that this use of models would oversimplify the reality, it was essential for such a study.

(f) Geographic Strategy of Environment

118. Mr. MOYNIHAN endorsed the general lines of his French colleague's lucid exposé of a complex problem. In reply to the French invitation, he stated that the United States was willing to assist both before and during the meeting proposed for February 1971, and to contribute to the French modelling studies as desired.

119. Answering a question on the kind of assistance which France might expect from other member nations, Mr. ESSIG said he would welcome knowledge of any national experience in regionalisation problems and any technical information or advice on modelling techniques in support of a study of the kind at present being undertaken by the Centre de Recherche Scientifique et Technique.

120. The CHAIRMAN raised the question of the procedures for forwarding available assistance of the kind required to France. He said this was part of the problem of liaison which applied equally to all pilot projects and which was essential to their viability. He had originally hoped that the Secretariat could nominate a member of the Staff to ensure the vital contact between interested countries, but in the present state of financial resources this had not proved possible. There were of course informal contacts in existence between experts, but over and above this, some formal means of liaison was important. It was his suggestion that consideration be given to the nomination of a pilot study leader by each interested pilot country, who could then be in direct contact with the liaison officers already designated in the International Secretariat and in national delegations at the Headquarters.

121. Mr. MARSHALL emphasised that the fullest use should be made of the exceptional infrastructure and organization which NATO, unlike most international organizations, enjoyed.

122. The COMMITTEE:

noted with appreciation the French presentation on the Geographic Strategy of Environment and the statements made in discussion.

(g) Individual and Group Motivation

123. Dr. COTTRELL presented to the Committee his progress report on the United Kingdom pilot study which was being undertaken under the title "Work, Technology and Satisfaction(1)". In connection with the arrangements which were under discussion in the United Kingdom for a full-time pilot study leader, he said he would inform the Committee of the expert's name and responsibilities as soon as organizational arrangements had been determined. The specialist in question would have considerable support from the United Kingdom Government and a major part of his work would be to visit and gain experience in several countries and environments.

124. Mr. MOYNIHAN welcomed the study undertaken by the United Kingdom and noted with particular satisfaction the intention to involve the experience of members of the International Labour Organization. Although some job satisfaction data existed within the United States, as yet there was very little theoretical understanding of the measurements which had been made.

125. The COMMITTEE:

noted with appreciation the United Kingdom presentation on its pilot study.

(h) Transmission of Scientific Knowledge to Decision-Making

126. Professor DAHRENDORF (Germany) said the German pilot project differed in several important respects from the other projects, and yet was related to them all(2). It was his intention to illustrate this point, to indicate what had or had not been accomplished so far in the transmission of scientific knowledge into political decision-making, and to set down some ideas on how this might best be tackled.

127. One consequence of the establishment of the CCMS had been the recognition by member governments of the need for a reorganization of their structures in order more rationally and more efficiently to handle environmental problems; Dr. Uffen had clearly underlined this point in his opening statement. Within the Federal Republic, an examination of this question had led to the definition of three problem areas, namely, the co-ordination of research, the co-ordination of government action, and the co-ordination of domestic and international activities.

(1) Attached at Annex III

(2) The outline of Professor Dahrendorf's presentation is found at Annex IV

128. As far as the first point was concerned, he emphasised that the German Government, despite its lively interest in research, did not believe in a policy of government direction, and accordingly limited its participation in research projects, not least with respect to its financial contributions. In the field of environmental research, such co-ordination as was needed would be the responsibility of single Ministry.

129. With respect to the co-ordination of government action, the Federal Government, faced with a situation very similar to that in Canada, had made only very recent efforts to co-ordinate the work of a large number of departments with individual responsibilities in connected areas, but had now established a working group in the Federal Chancellor's Office. The Head of this group, Dr. Haedrich, was present, and willing to discuss his functions with interested representatives.

130. The third problem which had been defined was the need for a kind of "turntable" or chronological synchronisation between domestic and international activities, by means of which actions and ideas on a domestic level might be collated for dissemination and expansion in international fora. This function, which was of particular significance for Europe, where so many environmental problems were common to a large number of neighbouring states, was to be assumed by a sub-department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

131. There were, however, other aspects of the problem of transmitting scientific knowledge into political decision-making, and in this connection, he wished to come back to his conviction of the relationship of the German pilot study to the other pilot studies. It was, he said, essential to avoid generalisation and theory when discussing the process which he was attempting to analyse. It was preferable to relate it to practicalities. This could be accomplished by an examination of the process in relation to each of the specific issues already selected for CCMS study and the way in which their transmission into decision-making at government level was taking place in actual fact.

132. In such an investigation, three areas would require particular attention:

Firstly, "organizational solutions", that is, the avoidance of uninformed decisions by decision-makers in various member countries on any of the pilot items - this was obviously a delicate and difficult matter;

Second, the setting up of constitutional safeguards for avoiding uncontrolled decisions by scientists, or the abuse of expertise;

Third, the manner in which one might inform and educate administrators so as to permit them to base their decisions on reasonable and effective scientific knowledge.

133. It was vital that all member nations contribute by their declared readiness to allow an analysis of the process of translating knowledge into decision within their own structures and on the lines of the intentions he had just outlined. Study groups might be formed, largely composed of social scientists who would be closely associated with the processes of government, but only over limited periods of time, so that they be given the opportunity to observe what actually took place without allowing familiarity with procedures to diminish their objectivity and freshness. Designation of a co-ordinator of study groups was envisaged and the Federal Republic was prepared to nominate such a person shortly and to call a conference under his direction at which interested nations could exchange their experience and comment on German suggestions. A final report on the investigation would be a "companion piece" to the reports of other projects and closely related to their progress.

134. As far as the implementation of the study was concerned, he pointed out that this was an exceptional subject in that it would be necessary for its viability for the CCMS to take a decision on independent research work.

135. Dr. Dahrendorf's final point concerned his hopes of the introduction of environmental problems into the East-West dialogue. Recognising the arguments both for and against introducing an investigation of political structures as a subject appropriate for co-operation between East and West, he said he was in fact open-minded on the subject but hoped its suitability would not be definitely overlooked.

136. Mr. MOYNIHAN, whose tribute to Dr. Dahrendorf's statement was echoed by subsequent speakers, declared United States' willingness to co-operate with the Federal Republic in this project, not only by establishing a study group in Washington, but also by welcoming the visit of research study groups from elsewhere to investigate United States organization. He wished, however, to warn against oversimplifying the problem.

137. Dr. COTTRELL commented that the United Kingdom belief in the overriding importance of the CCMS as a vehicle for progressing in the social field was an additional reason for welcoming the German proposal.

138. Dr. UFFEN expressed his particular interest in what he called the "controllability value" of the German proposal which so closely linked the study to the practical items under parallel consideration in pilot nations. In this connection, he was somewhat apprehensive of its inclusion as a subject amenable to East-West dialogue, since the latter might introduce a complexity which would jeopardise precisely the controllability which constituted its original value.

139. Mr. ESSIG expressed his country's interest in the subject which Dr. Dahrendorf had treated in his statement. France had, he said, a certain experience in the field of co-ordination and liaison between scientific and administrative organizations and was ready to contribute to the study proposed by the Federal Republic as far as possible. In any case, he was able to give his unreserved approval to both the statement and proposal which Dr. Dahrendorf had made.

140. Turning to the question of procedures for pursuing the German study, the CHAIRMAN asked if it were likely that some aspects of the project might not mature before others and might thus call for COMS consideration in advance of the final report, as had been or would be the case with some other pilot studies.

141. Dr. DAHRENDORF agreed that this might be the case. As far as a timetable was concerned, he could only assure his colleagues that there would be no undue delay in putting intention into action and that their remarks and encouragement at this meeting would serve only to accelerate the matter.

142. Ambassador PACE drew the Committee's attention to a recent OECD document which listed at some length organizations dealing with various aspects of environment problems. The incompleteness of this paper was but proof of the vastness of the whole problem of co-ordinating environmental studies, and of the parallel need for co-ordination on the internal level. As yet the Netherlands had not advanced far on the organizational road and he was therefore not in a position to commit his Government in reply to Dr. Dahrendorf's statement.

143. Recalling a reference which his German colleague had made on a previous occasion to "peace research" problems, he confirmed that the Netherlands had done considerable work on this subject and were willing to contribute. Illustrative papers were under preparation.

144. Dr. DAHRENDORF said the Federal Republic was greatly interested in pursuing such studies not only because of their considerable importance in relation to foreign policy in general, but also perhaps on account of certain historical responsibility. There had, however, been some second thoughts on including subjects of this kind in the context of the German pilot study, at least for the moment.

145. The COMMITTEE:

noted with appreciation the German presentation on scientific knowledge and decision-making and the comments made in discussion.

IV. POSSIBLE FUTURE PROJECTS

146. Mr. MOYNIHAN introduced to the Committee the Mayor of Indianapolis, the Honourable Richard Lugar, who was attending this meeting at the request of President Nixon to present views on the kind of initiatives which the CCMS might take in order to improve the conditions of human life in cities.

147. Mr. LUGAR's speech, copies of which were distributed to participants at the meeting, was based on the speaker's conviction of the possibility of responding to threats to human security, and of improving what he called the very length, quality and purpose of living together. It was, he said, the paradox of the times that NATO with its fundamental commitment to peace existed in an era of erosion of respect for authority, challenge to government and deep pessimism about the future of humanity. The hazards of living together, which followed identical patterns at the local, national and international level, were malformations of society which were often dismissed as increased urbanisation or even "crisis of the Cities". It was the belabouring of this gross and inaccurate oversimplification which he sought to refute in his subsequent description of the commitment and achievements of his own city.

148. Concluding with the defence of city governments, as "crowning jewels for the diadem of NATO", the speaker put forward a proposal for a Conference of Mayors in Indianapolis in 1971 which might establish NATO channels of communication on urban matters and define the basis on which cities could be governed with the maximum of freedom and order; this could perhaps be a first step towards establishing an urban affairs pilot project within the CCMS.

149. Dr. UFFEN said he had recognised many common problems in Mr. Lugar's delightful but eminently serious statement on city life. There were, however, some organizational problems related to the kind of conference which he had proposed, and, in particular, he was concerned about the participation which was expected.

150. Mr. ESSIG took up his Canadian colleague's remark by underlining the difficulties posed by the considerable variations in the mayoral functions which pertained from urban centre to urban centre. Not only was this a question of the size and population of the town or city, but also of varying competence and responsibility assigned to the leading citizen. The Agenda of a mayoral conference should not ignore this fundamental consideration.

151. A further question arose in connection with the co-ordination of a mayoral conference with the activity of COMS; should the two run in parallel, or would it be preferable to hold aside the urban project until after the completion of current study? And, finally, was this in fact a suggestion appropriate for exploration under the aegis of NATO?

152. Mr. LUGAR, in his reply, said he believed that local authority organization varied from nation to nation and that it would be a mistake to attempt to impose guidelines in advance of the event, when the best response to the proposal would surely be at the individual country's initiative. Contact might also be made, he suggested, with associations of mayors throughout the world and with the Council of Europe.

153. He recognised the points made by the French Representative, but insisted in response to the question raised on the competence of NATO in this area, that the peculiar organization and authority of NATO would make its patronage especially valuable. With respect to the question of representation, he said it was his conviction that the process of healing the fractures of society could be accomplished at the local level, whatever the power or significance of its municipal leader.

154. The CHAIRMAN noted that Mr. Luger's proposal was intended as a first step towards a pilot project, and as such, he said he believed it should be undertaken in parallel to the current studies.

155. As far as representation was concerned, he suggested, and the Committee agreed, that the proposal should be restricted to large metropolitan cities of something of the order of 750,000 population.

156. The COMMITTEE:

noted with appreciation the statement and proposal by the Honourable Richard Luger and of the Chairman's undertaking to report thereon to the Council.

V. EXAMINATION OF ENVIRONMENTAL STUDIES MORE APPROPRIATE TO EAST-WEST CO-OPERATION

157. The CHAIRMAN emphasised that the Committee's views were not sought on the advisability of undertaking a co-ordinated approach to certain environmental projects between East and West, as this was clearly a political choice which remained the responsibility of the North Atlantic Council. They were invited, however, to indicate if certain aspects of the COMS studies were more or less likely to raise sufficient interest in the East and thus prove of value for a co-ordinated search for remedies or the application of agreed practical solutions.

158. Mr. **HERTER** (United States) considered it useful in this connection to review the topics which had received the greatest attention from the countries of Eastern Europe at the preparatory conference on environment of the Economic Commission for Europe. Apparently there was a profound and general concern in the East about the problems of pollution. It was also to be noted that Eastern experts approached these problems with the aim of identifying their sources and of searching for remedial actions at an early stage. Urban and regional development problems had similarly drawn attention; the Czechoslovak Authorities had recently organized a visit in an area recently resuscitated from economic blight and extreme interest had been expressed in obtaining assistance and exchanging experience in the techniques applicable to these problem areas. Finally, he could imagine that the hazards of road safety were not matters of indifference to Eastern Europe.

159. Mr. **DROGE** recalled Dr. Dahrendorf's statement in favour of introducing environmental problems into the East/Western dialogue.

160. Mr. **PEMBERTON-PIGOTT** believed there were environmental studies of both a technical and non-technical nature which could be investigated with real profit on a co-operative basis with the East. On the other hand, the existence of the ECE tended to take such matters out of NATO/CCMS hands and whilst he recognised that the two fora could exist together, he felt it might be preferable for the CCMS to pursue their current pilot projects as far as possible before involving Eastern participation.

161. Mr. **BARNE** recalled that the CCMS should merely select from among the subjects with which it dealt those which might be suitable for co-operation with the East.

162. The **CHAIRMAN** pointed out that it was at the instigation of a member of the Committee that this matter was on the Agenda of the CCMS, but it was not, he said, intended that a consideration of the possibility of East-West co-operation should in any way delay or hamper the work of the Committee already in progress.

163. As far as relations with the ECE activity were concerned, it seemed it would be of advantage to NATO for it to be known by the ECE that these problems had been discussed and a positive attitude adopted. On the other hand, an unfortunate impression might be created if the recommendations of the Committee of subjects appropriate for East-West co-operation appeared to exclude all others.

164. In reply to a United States' suggestion that as a basis for future studies, the CCMS might draw up a list of East-West bilateral arrangements already in existence in environmental fields, he said it was difficult for the Committee to undertake such a task since no supplementary staff could at this time be designated for CCMS studies; however, the Science Committee might be invited to expand on a proposed forthcoming survey of East-West scientific exchanges to cover this point.

165. The COMMITTEE:

agreed to inform the Council that of the studies currently being undertaken by the CCMS, the following seemed appropriate for East-West co-operation:

air pollution;

open water pollution;

inland water pollution;

road safety;

geographic strategy of environment.

VI. PROGRESS REPORT TO MINISTERS

Reference: C-R(70)5

166. The CHAIRMAN observed that the progress report to the Council in Ministerial Session would in many respects resemble his own report to the Council. Particular note should be made of the recommendations on disaster assistance, on the presentation of proposed French pilot project, on the discussions which had taken place on East-West co-operation and on the recommendations made under the survey of methods of work.

167. Mr. SAHINBAS requested that mention be made in the report to Ministers of the experience gained within the NATO Organization during the Gediz earthquake, and it was noted that some indication would be given of the part played by NATO during this catastrophe in establishing a standby capability or mechanism for a clearing house.

168. The COMMITTEE:

invited the Chairman to draft a report for submission to the Council in Ministerial Session, bearing in mind the points made in discussion, and noted that this report would be circulated for the approval of delegations.

VII. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

169. The COMMITTEE:

agreed that, subject to confirmation, its next plenary session would be held on 19th and 20th October, 1970.

NATO,
1110 Brussels.

NOT RECLASSIFIED
DATE 10/11/2011

PROPOSED CANADIAN PILOT PROJECT

INLAND WATERS POLLUTION

Pollution of the fresh water resources is a problem of evident concern to all developed countries; and is a problem with social, economic and political dimensions of special significance to nations of the NATO Alliance. At the founding meeting of the Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society, Canada expressed its concern for the problems of pollution generally and its interest in participating as a pilot nation in inland water pollution. Canada is now prepared to undertake a pilot project based on the development of a comprehensive plan for water pollution control in one or more typical major lake or river basins. Apart from the technical aspects of the problem, special emphasis will be given to the development of effective communication between planners and local citizens and interested groups in such a way that the plan will be appropriate to the needs and aspirations of the people affected. The pilot project will also develop the most appropriate financial mechanisms for co-ordinating activities which involve the responsibilities of a number of government agencies and will provide methods for carrying out the plan in a basin where jurisdiction is divided between more than one government.

Canada invites countries of the NATO Alliance to participate as co-pilots in this undertaking by conducting corresponding projects to evaluate the planning process in different physical and cultural environments. Canada's experience through the proposed pilot project would be made available to the COMS for the implementation of programmes for the control of inland waters pollution.

The Water Pollution Problem

Canada, and indeed all developed countries, have become accustomed to measuring national goals in terms of Gross National Product and other indicators of economic development. But these economic indicators do not take into account the deteriorating quality of the environment and the ecological damage that all too often has been a by-product of the economic development. The result has often been a pervasive sense of frustration by those people who have struggled to achieve better living standards only to find that the quality of life is eroded by forces seemingly beyond their control. Particularly to many of the young people in Canada, it is apparent that many of the values and attitudes that were successful in shaping the nation from a pioneer economy are no longer of dominant concern.

NOT RECLASSIFIED

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DÉCLASSIFIÉ - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

NATO UNCLASSIFIED
CONFIDENTIAL

Thirdly, these needs and attitudes will change as the impact of the new programme is felt, and it is important to assess the changing requirements that will accompany implementation of the plan so it will remain current and effective as it is put into practice. And it is important that people who share a common river or lake basin see clearly that they are part of a community with a common interest in the development of an ethic of concern for pollution control.

The type of problem discussed here occurs in many facets of government activity, but particularly with water resources it is essential that plans be related to the needs of people directly affected. Water is essential to industry, to urban growth, to many agricultural pursuits, to recreation and to many other areas. In the past, it could be argued that combining public opinion and technical competence has resulted in piecemeal solutions. But in the water field, and facing today's demands for effective management, the need for a comprehensive management approach must be reconciled with public needs and priorities.

The physical characteristics of different basins will vary greatly between countries, and the needs of the people affected will be very different as well. However, there are also many common interests. Canada shares with many nations the characteristics of a federal state. (Some rivers and lakes are international.) Canada is a bilingual country with many cultural groups. The approaches developed in one country to involve the public in the planning process and the institutional arrangements provided to carry out such plans should have extensive application in other countries of the NATO Alliance.

Proposed Pilot Project

The proposed pilot project under the GEM would involve Canada and other co-pilots developing comprehensive basin plans for inland water pollution control through public participation in the planning process. The core element of the pilot project would be the development of concepts and techniques through public involvement to provide more effective control programmes in basins with divided jurisdiction.

Each case would involve a cyclical approach to planning. The physical dimensions of the pollution problem in the basins would be evaluated and technical alternatives developed. A team of social scientists would then conduct interviews with the planners, influential local citizens and a sample of the basin population. These surveys would be used as input to a series of joint meetings or workshops in which professional planners would meet with local citizens to develop the framework of the plan. Other forums would be provided as appropriate to inform the public of the technical dimensions of

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DÉCLASSIFIÉ - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

UNCLASSIFIED

ENVIRONMENT AND THE STATUS OF HUMAN DEVELOPMENT

The various pilot projects initiated by the Committee represent "sector" or "vertical" approaches to the environment problem: they make it easier to explore these fields thoroughly and to reach conclusions of practical use to those responsible for policy. However, such a system of study does not enable one to grasp the interaction of the phenomena whose combined effect shapes our environment. We feel that the work of this Committee might usefully be completed by means of a synthetic approach which would make it easier to realize what is meant by the environment as a whole. This is the aim of the paper which the French Delegation will now present.

The surroundings in which we live are being constantly and totally created as the result of the interplay of multiple qualitative factors, the complex and subtle relations between which shape our living space in a way which varies from one place to another. Generally speaking, for the past two centuries the environment has been the by-product of activities whose purpose was economic development, and is considered as being the chief aim of progress. This notion, which is very common in the developing countries today, soon becomes narrowly financial and commercial. Generally speaking, this means that progress is equated simply in terms of quantity, individual action aiming at immediate gain is favored by the level of income.

However, the last 25 years have taught us that development must be universal, if we are not to lose on the swings what we are trying to gain on the roundabouts. This anxiety is very clearly expressed in a message in Report No. 10 on the UNESCO Conference held in September 1980. Efforts to preserve the quality of the environment must be contrasted with the effects it will have on the future of civilization, rather than with maintaining it in its actual state. Society everywhere seems to be prepared to accept whatever is lost as the economic wealth increases, the only limitation being whether material or due to the land of man, which retain their quality and those which cannot possibly be exploited industrially and economically.

As regards economic development, while much remains to be done, the community does possess administrative authorities, universities, numerous technical consultants, works of reference, accurate documentation and a highly-developed theoretical background, in short a vast body of acquired knowledge on which the best brains are working.

This is not the case as regards the quality of the environment, and it is probable that 25 to 30 years, a generation at least, will be needed to reach a similar level of knowledge and intellectual mastery. As President Pompidou said when speaking of these challenges of modern society in Chicago, it is clear that institutions change very slowly compared with the breathtaking development of techniques.

UNCLASSIFIED

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DECLASSIFIE - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

UNCLASSIFIED
NATO UNCLASSIFIED
SECRET

The desire to arrive at an overall concept is not, however, merely a proof of a high intellectual standard, it is also a fundamental necessity arising from the very nature of the dual notions of development and environment. Our way of thinking must be profoundly changed if we wish to master our environment.

It is already apparent, and will become increasingly obvious, that the qualitative aspects must be given due importance, because the need for quality corresponds to a higher ultimate aim than that of the satisfaction of material needs, which are being increasingly met by mass-production.

We must not be satisfied with finding technical solutions (even though they may be perfect within a limited field) simply to those aggressions which are measurable; such answers would be quite inadequate to solve the vague uneasiness felt by our society in the face of what it fears may be the failure of a civilization with purely materialistic and transitory aims.

For instance, it is important to know that the average individual can tolerate physiologically only a given maximum concentration of toxic gas in the atmosphere he breathes, and to know exactly what lesions are produced by a certain excessive noise level. But it is equally important to know that the same individual will probably be subjected all day long to the overall influence of the aggressions which have been analysed and whose complex interactions must be studied just as carefully as their direct effects.

There is still however a danger that this will merely lead to palliative measures which are of obvious immediate value but may mask the connection at a higher level between the hygiene of the environment and its development.

- bearing this in mind, we must have and must realize that the environment constitutes the day-to-day setting in which each man lives and, as such, forms an integral part of development problems;
- remember that the multiplicity of relations between individuals and social groups, and the large amount of individual enterprise in matters of environment, presuppose that the public authorities (administrations and regional bodies) have the right to intervene;
- make it clear that environment concerns everybody's living conditions so closely that the necessary decisions must be political ones.

UNCLASSIFIED
NATO UNCLASSIFIED

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DECLASSIFIE - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

NATO UNCLASSIFIED
REF ID: A66144

If, however, we wish, in our day, to accentuate the distinctive character of all our towns, including those which have no ancient past to give them natural originality, we need a more exact science, which will be more aware of the permanent features of the surroundings in which we live and of the new paths we must tread, for originality is not only based on past traditions or on a geographical site, but is constantly being created.

There were a few general ideas concerning a regional approach to environment problems. Is it possible to give concrete examples to illustrate these remarks? I shall mention three drawn from our experience in France. One of them is concerned with action taken in a limited field, but having direct repercussions on development: it is the management of water resources. The other two cover regional development policies.

1. The management of water resources

Despite the relatively abundant freshwater supplies available in France, it is no longer possible, owing to the varied and increasing number of uses to which it is put, to consider that unlimited water is available for all. It must be regarded as a raw material to be exploited rationally. The French Act of 16th December, 1964 lays down the main lines for such management, by providing for administrative co-ordination under the aegis of the Minister advising the Prime Minister on the Plan and for National Development (*L'Aménagement du Territoire*), and by setting up appropriate regional bodies.

I am particularly concerned with the latter. The Act of 1964 provides for the establishment of two regional bodies:

- catchment committees, which are basically consultative in character;
- catchment-area financial agencies, which are financially-autonomous public corporations.

Territorial responsibility is exercised at catchment-area level, which seems to be the most appropriate one for applying a water policy, since the complex problems concerning the causes and effects of pollution and the multiple successive or simultaneous uses to which the same water is put can only be resolved at regional level.

2. The preservation of natural areas between built-up areas: the lower Seine valley, between Paris and Le Havre.

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DÉCLASSIFIÉ - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

APPENDIX 1 to
A/72/4-113

Certainly, the welfare of citizens is best served by economic achievement balanced with programmes for the management of the quality of the environment. The water resource, which has been used freely for hydro-power development, as a transportation artery, and as a convenient and efficient means to carry off the wastes from an increasingly industrialized society, has been a major factor in the economic achievement of the nation. It is equally certain that effective programmes for water pollution control are now required so the citizens can achieve full benefit from the economic achievement.

The water pollution problems that have developed in Canada through a hundred years and more are now and diverse, and the challenges now facing Canada to develop effective means to deal with these problems are equally diverse. They range from control of pollution of the Fraser River on the West Coast with the attendant effects on the salmon fishery and the recreational potential of the river; the Mackenzie-Nelson system which spans the prairie region and requires a pollution control programme that involves three provincial governments, (the federal government, and the interests of major urban and industrial interests); the lower Great Lakes system where the assimilative capacity is greatly overtaxed and an international programme is required to arrest eutrophication and decay; to the Saint John River where the federal government and the Province of New Brunswick are undertaking a co-operative planning programme to manage effectively the quality of the water resource. Here, too, there are international implications. Hence, the actions that must be taken are as varied as the geography and needs of the people affected.

The Planning Process

For Canada, with its diverse regional characteristics and the variety of the problems to be tackled, effective control of pollution requires a comprehensive plan for implementation that is specific to each basin. In view of the divided responsibilities in Canada between the federal and provincial governments, institutional arrangements must be set up to carry out the planning process in a co-operative manner involving more than one governmental jurisdiction. And overriding is the need for the plan to be appropriate to the local needs and perspectives of the people directly affected by the water quality management programme to be implemented.

The involvement of the citizens in the planning process is a crucial and difficult process. There may be considerable misunderstanding by the public of the technological alternatives that are available, or the impact that these will have. Equally, it is difficult for the administrator in a government programme to understand fully the needs and attitudes of the people directly affected by a basin management programme.

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DÉCLASSIFIÉ - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

**ANNEX I to
AG/214-83**

the pollution problem and to assist the development of a common perspective of the pollution problem among the citizens that share the rewards or failures of the basin plan. The sequence would be repeated as required, and a detailed plan for basin management would be worked out and tested with the interested citizens who would become increasingly aware of the many implications of the planning alternatives.

The final result in each case would be a comprehensive plan made available to be carried out through institutional arrangements developed appropriate to the responsibilities and political interests of the several jurisdictions involved. It would be a plan that could be undertaken with assurance of acceptance by the citizens for whom the plan had been developed.

Canada, as pilot country, would make extensive use of films and video tape recording equipment, and would fully utilise these techniques both as a tool for broad involvement of the public in the study, and as a means to record and communicate results of the pilot undertaking with a co-pilot nation and with other members of the CCMS.

Canada invites member nations of the CCMS to participate as co-pilots in the proposed undertaking. Canada is prepared to hold a workshop session with the co-pilots in the autumn of 1970 to develop in detail the approach and schedule for carrying out the project. This workshop would be designed to assist the selection of basins and study concepts that would be of greatest benefit to the development of water pollution control programmes within the member nations of the NATO Alliance. Reports to the CCMS would follow at an appropriate stage in the pilot project.

To explore various aspects of this matter further and establish the degree of interest of potential co-pilots, we would like to propose that a preliminary meeting of experts be held here in Brussels towards the latter part of June.

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DÉCLASSIFIÉ - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

INDEX II to
 AU/274-275

This is very serious, for it is useless to expect that the qualities we are beginning to require our surroundings to possess will develop spontaneously side-by-side with economic progress. If anything, the environment seems to be deteriorating inevitably as the economy advances. At the present time, this fact is widely appreciated, as is shown by the quantity and quality of the different studies being undertaken by nations and international organizations.

In France, as elsewhere, the damage done to the various environmental factors has become apparent at different moments and its unsettling effects have been felt to a greater or lesser extent in different geographical areas. If the environment is considered from two angles, hygiene and "development", it will be seen that attention has been mainly directed to the former. If the choice lies between spoiling the scenery and suffocating in the centre of a city, it is natural for priority to be given to protection against the physical assaults of surroundings which have to some extent got out of the control of society. Thus, a series of studies has been made concerning protection against nuisances affecting the organism through the medium of water, air, noise and vibration. Laws have been passed and public or private bodies set up on an ad hoc basis.

It would, however, appear that the 1970s will mark a turning point in the orientation of research. It is already becoming apparent that although such harmful consequences of economic progress must be examined, such studies, even when extensive, are powerless to solve what you very rightly call "the challenges of modern society".

To overcome these, we shall have to reconsider the entire basis of our development policies and rediscover an ultimate purpose whose harmful consequences do not exceed the positive result which was originally sought after.

Consequently, an ecological view of development is essential in order to modify over-rigid doctrines based on technical perfection, quick profits, or even aesthetic qualities. Ecology must guide us in two ways: the first stage will be to inform us about the delicate balance which exists in nature when man forms part of it, and facilitate a more fruitful approach to development in natural surroundings. Secondly, ecological reasoning will supplement the present foundations of our way of thinking, which is too often influenced by a mathematical and legal system of operation.

The exact sciences and the mastery of numbers, which we have inherited from the nineteenth century and developed to a very high degree, are expressed in the same general terms and produce the same consequences, as befits their capacity for abstraction at the expense of originality.

ANNEX I
 AG/214-173

To return to what was said by President POMPIDOU in his Chicago speech: "We must create and promulgate some kind of "environment morality" which will oblige the state, the community and the individual to respect certain simple rules, without which this world would become unlivable. It follows that the public authorities will have an increasingly important part to play, since it is for them to lay down rules and decide on restrictions. But the application of these rules cannot be left simply to officials or technicians. In a sphere which directly concerns the daily life of mankind, the control and the effective participation of the citizen in the development of his surroundings is more important than anywhere else."

We consider that the most suitable political framework is the region, for diversity and originality are best expressed at this territorial level, where actual situations can most clearly be appreciated. This is a vital necessity, for environment is significant in relation to man, as when it produces certain effects.

The implications of this theme are obviously important as regards the future planning aspects of regional development. It is reasonable to suppose that the gradual reduction in wage differences between various regions, together with increasing mobility, will tend to concentrate the active population in the regions with the most favourable environment, and that economic development will henceforward be liable to depend more and more on the quality of the surroundings, rather than on power resources or raw materials. Action should therefore be taken to prevent existing resources from being eroded or irrevocably spoilt by concentrations of population such as those we know today.

So long as damage to the environment was due to isolated factors, it could be dealt with by regulations and technical measures which were relatively easy to apply and were constantly being improved. The case is quite different when sources of nuisance caused by industry or simply by the presence of men are concentrated in a limited area. This accumulation cancels out the advantages gained by specific measures against nuisances and also makes it difficult to enforce any regulations.

The most obvious consequence of this tendency and mobility is a certain regrettable uniformity in our environment. For the moment, this is simply taken as a proof of higher living standards, a success symbol, like the substitution of functional but anonymous household effects for traditional peasant furniture. It is already clear that those regions which have succeeded in preserving their personality will soon earn an amenity bonus.

ANNEX 21 to
10/214-113

We all know that the maintenance of natural agricultural and wooded open spaces between built-up areas in rapidly-developing regions is a very pressing problem. This is especially true of the lower Seine Valley, which constitutes the most favoured line of communications between Paris and its natural outlet to the sea. Industrial development is constantly increasing along this important axis (waterway, railway and motorway), while on the other hand urban development in a densely-populated and highly-equipped corridor could well result in a conurbation stretching from PARIS to the sea, if no action were to be taken. The outline plan proposed by the Mission d'études de la Basse-Seine, and approved by the Government, provides for the preservation of natural open spaces between PARIS and ROUEN and between ROUEN and LE HAVRE.

The preservation of a natural open space may be included, for the form, in the general framework of a regional development plan, but it must be sponsored at regional level if it is to become a reality. Because they are nibbled away by so many building operations, and because the qualities it is desired to preserve (not only for agriculture but also, to an increasing extent, for vital recreational purposes) are impoverished by so many operations thoughtlessly carried out regardless of their ecological consequences, open spaces must henceforth be considered as forming a specific part of urban amenities. Unless they possess such a green belt, cities will, within the next few tens of years, lose the attractiveness of their centres still offer.

It is clear that the numerous decisions and actions required to preserve and improve the quality of the environment cannot be taken solely at regional level.

3. The development of a semi-industrial region: the Aix-Marseille region.

The Marseille region, which is the bastion of the French Mediterranean seafront, and is located at the outlet of the Rhone Valley communications axis, is one of those areas whose expansion will be very largely determined by the attractiveness of its surroundings. The climate, the varied scenery and the coastline of this region give it a high amenity value. At the same time, however, its charm is likely to decrease unless the consequences of its economic expansion are fairly closely controlled, the territorial authorities, i.e. the region and the local communities, undertaking planning responsibility. To mention a specific instance, one of the important problems in this region is waste disposal, the regulations governing which can be of only limited effectiveness unless all the municipalities decide to enforce them rigorously.

NATO UNCLASSIFIED
SECRET

Another example is that of the construction of dwellings in rural areas on the outskirts of towns. An effective policy will entail complete control of relations between the town - which must not tempt its inhabitants to the extent of forcing more and more of them to look for houses outside its boundaries - and the countryside, whose rural structures must be sufficiently solid for it to benefit from the proximity of the town and its redevelopment, instead of suffering from it. These are complex overall problems, which can be fully understood in their day-to-day aspects solely by regional authorities, who are the only ones capable of integrating, at the right time and place, such multiple active elements as the university, industry, agriculture, the population as a whole and its leaders.

These examples illustrate the part that can be played by regions and local communities. It must however be clearly understood that it would be a mistake to rely only on the action of these territorial authorities. Effective efforts are only possible in the context of flexible structures at the various levels of political responsibility, so as to avoid incoherence between decisions taken at different levels, which is one of the main reasons for the deterioration of the environment.

This is equally true on the national plane, where the success of national or regional action will depend on legislation and economic practice being brought into line, as a result of negotiations ranging from bilateral consultations to large-scale international conferences.

The strategy of overall regional development involving the integration of economic progress and a better environment will therefore be based on the participation of the inhabitants and on increased "horizontal" knowledge, which are complementary factors. It is clear from the facts that we do not know precisely how to equate the two terms: standard of living and environment. The first stage must be to impose a levy on the expansion of the first in order to provide the resources necessary to improve the second, but we must endeavour here and now to minimise this levy or transfer, which presupposes that we are already making efforts to reduce the damage which it will be so costly to put right later.

To sum up:

- solutions to specific problems, however useful they may be, are limited in scope;
- our habitual way of thinking must be called into question, preference being given to the synthetic approach;

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DECLASSIFIE - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

ANNEX I - 10
AC/324-N/2

- the following factors are of vital importance;
- the distinctive character of the region;
- the existence of responsible, political and civil institutions;
- flexible consultation at all levels, up to and including the international level, which will ensure the overall effectiveness of any action taken to link economic progress with the improvement of the surroundings in which we live.

These are the arguments underlying the proposal which France brought to the notice of the North Atlantic Council last January and which I have the honour to submit to your Committee's attention today.

This proposal is as follows: France is prepared to be responsible for a project in connection with the work of the Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society.

The proposed study would cover the theme "Environment in the strategy of regional development", and would be the eighth theme, along with those of the United States, Belgium, the United Kingdom, Germany and Italy.

France naturally hopes that other countries will co-operate and contribute their own conclusions on a subject of such wide and general interest.

It considers that the report should not be submitted before the end of 1971, so that the results of "sector" studies now in hand can be incorporated. We propose to work along the following lines:

- (a) as regards the form, we hope it will be possible, following contact with other countries at the present meeting, and in addition to possible exchanges of views with those which have decided to collaborate with France on the theme of "Environment in the strategy of regional development", to organise a three-day meeting in February 1971 to discuss the theme, take stock of the work begun and decide how to complete it;
- (b) as regards the content, we propose to direct our efforts towards research into "models" capable of taking into account the complex phenomena which modify our environment. There is no doubt that this use of models will oversimplify the reality, but it is a necessary exercise if we are to succeed in laying down new aims and new procedures in a world where measurable factors carry such more weight than those whose nature prevents them from being given due importance in official documents.

~~TOP SECRET~~
~~SECRET~~
~~SECRET~~

As an example, I should like to mention, in general terms, a projected study, under the auspices of the Délégation Générale à la Recherche Scientifique et Technique, the purpose of which is in fact to produce a model linking the evolution of the functional relations between man and his environment with the evolution of the satisfactions and potentials of town life.

In this study, each need, such as nutrition, leisure, hygiene etc. is considered as a system, the systems being broken down into sub-systems according to such criteria as the categories of persons concerned by the need. Furthermore, each need is characterized by the nuisances arising from the operations required to satisfy it, and by the degree of satisfaction obtained. For instance: the need for leisure often involves the use of the motor car, which, at various stages from manufacture to use, produces factory smoke, traffic jams, exhaust gases and scrap metal, as against possible isolation in the countryside or attendance at some artistic or cultural event.

The construction of a model enables these general data to be integrated into the framework of a concrete situation, where local factors in particular will attenuate or simplify the phenomena. Thus a study of the balance between nuisance and satisfaction will be based on a detailed analysis of the factors involved in satisfying the needs of man and of society under clearly-defined geographical, economic and sociological conditions.

This is France's proposal to the Committee. I believe that we must be modest and realize the inadequacy of the concepts and of the technical capacities which we still generally employ when we intervene in the environment. As I said before, apart from a few fortunate exceptions, the environment is simply the chance resultant of factors which have been studied very carefully and, often, very scientifically for other reasons (technical, scientific, financial, etc.).

It is certainly possible to define the environment more accurately today, provided we distinguish between what is subtle and what is impossible, and between what is subjective and what is arbitrary. If we display imagination and insight we shall be able to formulate certain tendencies or even laws which will enable us to lay down, with greater awareness and confidence, courses of action which will enable needs to be more fully satisfied. This will constitute a source of research, reflection, or even controversy, and a subject for legislation, administrative action, education, information and training.

It is for this reason that France is very much interested in the aims of your Committee and is ready to participate as far as its possibilities and competence allow in the various existing working groups and to pilot the study which I have just had the pleasure of presenting.

~~TOP SECRET~~

STATEMENT BY UK REPRESENTATIVE AT MEETING ON
17th/18th April, 1970

("Work, Technology and Satisfaction")

At the first meeting of this Committee on 8th December, 1969, the United Kingdom undertook to initiate a pilot study on a social aspect of a human environment dealing with the effects of technological development on the work environment. In suggesting this broad theme, which we believe to be an important one, we were conscious that while physical problems of the environment, particularly pollution problems, are, and will increasingly be, the subject of international discussion, the impact on individual members of society of rapidly changing technology was receiving less attention. Technological change, especially the trend towards automation, has a major effect on our pattern of life and the nature of our daily work; indeed a more direct and profound effect than the conventional features of pollution, which are being examined in other studies to be presented to this Committee. These difficult human and social issues, which are common in a greater or lesser degree to all modern industrial societies and are thus worthy of international discussion, will have to be squarely faced if the great benefits of technology are not increasingly to imperil and diminish the quality of life.

The field of study which the UK has chosen concerns essentially the relationship in a changing environment between job satisfaction and proficiency at all levels. It is a field which has been accorded surprisingly little attention in relation to its importance. Published work has been limited in scope. We believe that a comprehensive review and comparison of the state of the art in many countries, which could serve as a compendium of information and point to needs for research in the immediate future, will make a real contribution to this Committee's work on the human environment.

It seems to us that some of the scientific method and acumen which has made modern technology so formidable should be applied to research on human work and the impact of technology on it. Our study would thus examine the results of research into the type of environment in which we work, be it pleasant or disagreeable, stimulating or monotonous, the degree of satisfaction of the individual in these different environments, and his consequential proficiency in performance.

ANNEX II to
AG/274-8/3

The successful completion of a review of this kind will require the co-operation of many member countries of this Organization. We are hopeful that we can look to member governments for support in this venture. This will be a study in depth of a subject that is, as yet, at a much earlier stage of development than those of the problems of the natural environment; and as such will not readily lend itself initially to being formally co-piloted by two or more governments. Rather what we have in mind is that the principal author of this work should visit some of those countries, of which there are several on both sides of the Atlantic, which have made a significant contribution to this field. An exchange of view with members of the staff of the International Labour Organization would, we think, also be useful.

If this study is to be truly comprehensive, based on experience in several countries and environments, and if it is to provide a satisfactory foundation for and a stimulus to further research work, it must be undertaken seriously. We have made arrangements for a full time author to be responsible for the study and, taking account of the time needed for consultation with other member governments, it will take the best part of a year to produce. We look forward to presenting this review in the first part of next year and to having a full discussion of it in this Committee. We would plan to give member governments a clear three months in which to study and comment on our paper, before tabling it at the COMS.

DECLASSIFIED - PUBLICLY DISCLOSED - AC/324-N(2012)0006 - DECLASSIFIE - MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

~~TOP SECRET~~
~~SECRET~~
~~SECRET~~

STATEMENT MADE BY STATE SECRETARY HANSEN AT THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION ON SCIENTIFIC AND TECHNICAL CO-OPERATION

I. Results and Proposals up to Now

Some measure of reorganization in the various countries already represents a first success of the Committee's work. However, three problems result:

- (a) The first problem is that of co-ordination within research. One proposal for a solution would be if this co-ordination would, at one rate, not be carried out by the government concerned even if it has assumed the financial responsibility.
- (b) A second problem is that of co-ordination of the projects carried out within any one country. This involves a large number of government departments. We in Germany have only just begun to carry out such co-ordination and have created a working group in the Federal Chancellor's Office, i.e. in the central agency where the political decisions are taken.
- (c) A third problem is that of chronological synchronization between national and international projects. The international dimension is of particular importance for us in Europe, and we have established a special office whose task it is to watch over the international character of the problems in the chronological synchronization.

II. Future Proposals

The organizational problems which have had the result that our own pilot project has not yet proceeded as far as we had hoped will - with the solutions we are now trying to find for them - also be of importance for the future work. The translation of scientific research into political decisions will only be one chapter in the valiant report which is to be the result of our work. The organizational problems will play an essential part in it. It would be easy for us to draft a particularly long and detailed report filled with vague language. However, this is not our intention. What we plan to do is to examine in each specific case how the political decision is taken.

- (a) A first study will have to deal with the organizational solutions. In this context, special importance must be attached to the contacts between scientists and decision-makers.

~~TOP SECRET~~
~~SECRET~~
~~SECRET~~

- (b) Secondly, we shall have to examine how uncontrolled decisions by the scientists can be avoided. Here, it will be necessary to control the experts.
- (c) Thirdly, the training and educational aspects will have to be examined.

III. Technical Questions

- (a) We would consider it very important that all member countries participate in these surveys. Investigations should be possible in all member countries.
- (b) As far as the composition of the study groups to be created is concerned, our idea would be to staff them with social scientists. The question arises whether smaller study groups should not be given access to the government's work for the purposes of their study and the duration of their activity. They should be given a possibility to obtain insight into the manner in which decisions are taken.
- (c) We are prepared to nominate a co-ordinator who would co-ordinate the overall control of the surveys.
- (d) The study groups should be enabled to carry out surveys in other countries as has been done in an exemplary fashion within OECD. It should not be considered sufficient that information is simply received by countries without the possibility of a critical examination.
- (e) For the implementation of this project, the Committee should decide to carry out independent research work. This project is the only one requiring such a decision.

IV. The East-West Dialogue as a Social Problem

We are examining the possibility of introducing environmental problems into the East-West dialogue. It should, of course, be carefully examined whether the subject of this project is suitable for inclusion into this dialogue. There are arguments for and against this. On this point, I should be grateful for suggestions and comments.